

The Internationalization of Dance in Taiwan's Higher Education: Legitimation Strategies

Hayward, Thomas* · Tai, JuanAnn**

- | | |
|--|-------------------------|
| I. Introduction | IV. Concluding Comments |
| II. Methodology | Bibliography |
| III. Dance and Internationalization Discourses | 국문초록 |

I. Introduction

The world we live in is interconnected like never before, creating opportunities and challenges for modern life in many parts of the globe. Globalization has brought about the integration of cultures and communities as people regularly interact. People in much of the world have opportunities to live in new ways, yet new forms of being must be reconciled with traditional forms, and there will always be a tension in this regard. Exploring the interaction between the global and the local, or as Robertson puts it, 'glocalization',¹⁾ has been a growing trend in research in the social sciences and cultural studies, as academics attempt to better understand how given contexts are affected by globalizing trends while at the same time dialectically influencing those trends.

Globalization is not the same thing as internationalization, but rather a principal inspiration for it. According to Knight²⁾, internationalization at institutional levels is defined as "the process of integrating an international, intercultural or global dimension into the purpose, functions, and delivery of post-secondary education". The term 'process' is important in this definition as internationalization is an on-going and continuing effort, and reflects the diversity of reasons why tertiary institutions engage in the effort over time. Shifting rationales reported in the research literature seem to bare this

* Principal and Corresponding Author, Assistant Professor, Nagoya University of Commerce and Business, tgaward9630@gmail.com

** Author, Professor, Tainan University of Technology

1) R. Robertson(1992), *Globalization: Social Theory and Global Culture*(London: Sage).

2) J. Knight(2006), *Internationalization of Higher Education: New Directions, New Challenges*. 2005 IAU Global Survey Report, (International Association of Universities (IAU)), p.13.

point out.³⁾

Today it is not uncommon to see international students on Taiwan's university campuses, either as degree students, on exchange visits from foreign partner institutions, or learning the Mandarin language. One also finds foreign members of faculty teaching courses and doing research on local campuses, and academic departments now regularly host international research conferences or send out delegations to conferences abroad. There are also an ever-growing number of programs offered in English to attract foreign students and local students alike in Taiwan, currently reaching a total of 207.⁴⁾ This article looks specifically at the discipline of dance in Taiwan's higher education, probing for the value assumptions that underlie the appeal to internationalize. The article looks at both the government level and local institutional level to understand how internationalization is legitimated in dance. It also looks for discursive contingencies between the articulations of the Ministry of Education, institutions, and scholars themselves, uncovering where these different domains disagree in their valuation of internationalization practices.

The article will be divided into four sections. Following the introduction, section 2 describes the methodology used as the framework for the article, explaining the key terms used and why certain texts were selected for analysis. The third section then identifies the four types of value assumptions that were found in the discourse analysis of the texts. These include a 'visibility' rationale, a 'sociocultural knowledge' rationale, a 'knowledge diversification and employability' rationale, and finally a discussion of the discourses used to resist internationalization in the dance field. The final section then discusses the findings and their significance for understanding the internationalization of dance in higher education in Taiwan.

II. Methodology

Before starting, a brief overview of the methodological framework will be provided to define the key terms used in the next section.

1. Discourse and articulation

In this article, the term 'discourse' is used as a count noun. Discourses are viewed as common-sense assumptions that underpin a person's knowledge of how the world can and should operate. Yet

3) Egron-Polak, E. (2012). Internationalization of higher education: A few global trends and regional perspectives, In C. Ennew and D. Greenaway (Eds.), *The Globalization of Higher Education* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan), pp.57-69.

4) Ministry of Education, Taiwan (2014), *2014 English Program List*, <http://web.roc-taiwan.org/public/CH_en_education/412017195571.pdf, 2016. 7. 29.>.

discourses have both an individual and a social element; individuals are social beings, and so, on a societal level, discourses are the basis for the social practices of a community, helping to define what motivates public action and why social institutions and their practices exist. In other words, discourses influence both public perceptions and individual actions, and because language (both spoken and written) is the key to transmitting assumptions between the individual and society and vice-versa, we can refer to this condition as a ‘dialectical relationship’.⁵⁾ An ‘articulation’ is the verbal action that realizes, or makes concrete, the underlying discourse. The ways that discourses are articulated show the value systems that underlie the discourses.

2. Legitimation and rationalization

The articulations that the article focuses on are ‘legitimation’ statements made by various actors in Taiwan’s dance field. This approach is inspired largely by the critical discourse analysis work of Theo van Leeuwen. According to van Leeuwen, an individual, institution or government body must often legitimize decisions taken when placed under external scrutiny, adopting one or more of the following four strategies to do this: ‘authorization’, ‘rationalization’, ‘moral evaluation’ and ‘mythopoesis’.⁶⁾ Due to the decentralization occurring in Taiwan’s higher education over the past two decades, the actors involved in the various domains generally focus their attention on providing rationales for internationalizing higher education practices, so legitimation is generally accomplished through ‘rationalization’ strategies.

A word about textual analysis is needed before starting. The purpose of using the framework is to give the researcher specific verbal constructions to look for in a text that signal legitimation in an articulation. Rationalization statements can be seen in two forms: instrumental rationalization and theoretical rationalization. Instrumental rationalization justifies an action based on the effects it is purported to have, while theoretical rationalization makes reference to the suitability of an idea based on how the world works. In analyzing texts, a ‘means / cause element’ and a ‘goal / effect element’ are identified that show how internationalization practices are rationalized instrumentally. In the quotes provided in the sections below, the means element will be bolded and the goal element underlined. See sample quote A for an example. In cases where theoretical rationalization is found in a quote, the internationalization practice is bolded and italicized while the theoretical statement that defines or explains it is italicized only. This is illustrated in sample quote B.

Example A:

“**Academic collaboration with foreign institutions** exposes local scholars to important new

5) N. Fairclough(2003), *Analysing Discourse: Textual Analysis for Social Research*(London: Routledge), p.2.

6) T. van Leeuwen(2007), Legitimation in discourse and communication, *Discourse and Communication* 1, pp.91–112.

innovations.”

Example B:

“*Internationalization* is a marker of a country’s higher education excellence.”

III. Dance and Internationalization Discourses

There are multiple voices that constitute Taiwan’s dance field, and so the data collected for this article come from more than just a few texts by informants who represent the dance field in Taiwan. Choosing sources that can be deemed representative of articulations in a given domain is an important consideration in a discourse analysis such as this one. For this article, then, only sources deemed knowledgeable of the value of internationalization to Taiwan’s dance field were sought out, and these included scholars and educators who hold important teaching positions and act as liaisons with important international dance research organizations, as well as texts published by trusted publishers. This section presents the themes that legitimate internationalization practices which emerged from various interview responses and from published written texts to give the reader an idea of what internationalization discourses shape Taiwan’s dance field.

1. Enhancing institutional and national visibility

One of the common discourses that legitimate the internationalization of the dance field is the effort of higher education institutions and the government to enhance national and institutional visibility. For much of the second half of the twentieth century, dance performance was incorporated in the national government’s efforts to build its soft power abroad.⁷⁾ After Taiwan lost its seat as the Chinese representative in the United Nations in 1971 and official ties were severed with many countries during the 1970s, the ROC government began to seek out unofficial ties with foreign countries, and so dance became a cultural export.⁸⁾ Dance for diplomacy had the effect of raising the status of the performing art as well, and stimulated growth in the number of professional dancers and educators as well as classes offered in the private sector. Cultural tours were made by the China Youth Goodwill Mission (CYGM), an organization that recruited young adults to perform patriotic dance pieces abroad between 1974 and 2001. Thus began a trend of international dance tours in general, whether government sponsored or private, since the late 1980s, as the economic development and the end of martial law allowed more private citizens to travel abroad. Regarding government support for the dance field as a means to project its soft diplomatic power, dance historian Y. P. Chen has this to say:

7) See Prevots (1998) for a discussion on how dance has been used as a form of cultural diplomacy.

8) J. A. Tai(2010a), *Dance as an Institutional Power: A Bourdieuan Approach to Socio-political Changes in Dance in Higher Education in Taiwan*, Unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Surrey, UK.

Example 1:

The need for **internationalization in dance**, is it intrinsic or extrinsic? Actually, I think it is both. It is intrinsic but also imposed by the education institution and the government policy... for that part, the marginalization of Taiwan politically is the main reason for that, because we have very, very little visibility on the international political stage... So to increase the visibility of Taiwan in any way is a very important policy of the government, and I think that is one of the reasons for the pushing...⁹⁾

In this quote, Chen directly points out the need for political visibility on the world stage, and through the means of internationalization (of universities and dance), this goal can be achieved.

The CYGM has now been replaced by a new program, the International Youth Ambassadors Exchange Program (IYA), and although its aims have diversified somewhat, its overall aim is the same: promote a positive image of Taiwan to the world and encourage unofficial exchanges. The following quote, taken from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs web page, is part of a text that introduces the aims of the program.

Example 2:

The **International Youth Exchange Ambassadors Program** has been a welcome favorite of university and college students in Taiwan over the five years that MOFA has conducted it. The roster of nations and areas included in the exchange program has expanded for the ROC's diplomatic allies to include other countries friendly to Taiwan; its footprint has spread from the South Pacific to include five continents.¹⁰⁾

Example 3:

The MOFA is taking an innovative approach to conducting the International Youth Ambassadors program this year in the hope that **through visiting foreign countries and interacting with their people**, our students will be able to demonstrate to our friends overseas that the ROC is indeed a peace-builder, provider of humanitarian aid, promoter of cultural exchanges, creator of new technology and business opportunities, and standard-bearer of Chinese culture for the international community.¹¹⁾

As the quotes here illustrate, the IYA is acting as a vehicle for promoting Taiwan on a variety of themes ranging across the cultural and business sectors. Students involved in the program are mainly of university age and many of them are recruited from dance departments at local universities. For

9) Y. P. Chen, personal communication, December 20, 2014.

10) Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Taiwan (2014), *2014 International Youth Ambassador Exchange Program Registration Underway*, <www.mofa.gov.tw/ENMobile?News_Content.aspx?s=3FE415105977ACFF>, 2014. 12. 3>.

11) Ibid.

these students, the program is a way to see the world, but also a chance to act as cultural ambassadors for Taiwan.

Enhancing visibility is also a common legitimation strategy for institutional internationalization. The Department of Dance at Tainan University of Technology (TUT) has made internationalization an significant part of its program over the past five years, and one of the reasons cited was gaining visibility for the department. The two faculty members interviewed about the department's internationalization practices spoke of the academic benefits expected from internationalization, though there was not total agreement about what this entailed. There was a general agreement that developing an education abroad program would be popularly supported by both students and faculty in the department, and would help attract potential students to study dance. Although neither of them discussed department competitiveness directly, their responses project the belief that creating short term and long term study opportunities for students as well as faculty exchanges would help the department expand its current academic scope and therefore be more attractive for students. Faculty member A explains:

Example 4:

It (the education abroad program) helps attract students to study with the department. There are many students who want the experience (of living abroad), and they like the structure and support we can provide. It seems that many of the other university dance departments (in Taiwan) are also making study opportunities abroad for their students, and so we have to do the same thing to keep pace... It is probably critical for us to keep adding to our (education abroad) offerings.¹²⁾

In this statement, education abroad is viewed as a means to making the department more competitive and visible in Taiwan's higher education. Both faculty members have the perception that making tours abroad will attract students to the department, although no specific reasons are stated for this. The visibility rationale therefore legitimates education abroad initiatives like setting up cultural exchange projects and attending international cultural festivals.

Visibility is also an articulated goal of the 'education at home' program, which includes cultural exchange projects and inviting foreign educators to teach children's dance workshops and master dance classes. This faculty member explains:

Example 5:

Each year our department recruits many of its students from local dance studios... and the workshops give them a chance to know how innovative our department is. **This kind of activity enhances their view of our department.** Local dance teachers will also have new teaching ideas to

12) Faculty member A, personal communication, March 2, 2014.

use in their studios, so there is a lot of interest from local dance professionals.¹³⁾

This quote highlights an important aspect of the summer workshops; they serve as a liaison between the department and surrounding community. The Ministry of Education in Taiwan has promoted more interaction between technical and vocational universities and the public in general so as to better ensure for the relevancy of department curricula. The rationale for supporting such kinds of universities is that they offer practical education to the public that will offer graduates the skills they need to find related jobs. This then helps the visibility of the department.

In summary, the above texts make clear that international dance tours and cultural exchanges are valued for international visibility purposes. As Chao notes, “the non-verbal character of dance is particularly effective in allowing viewers access to cultural understandings and representations without having to understand the language used by the performers’ culture”.¹⁴⁾ Thus, dance is used to build bridges to the international community. At the same time, internationalization in the form of ‘education at home’ programs at local universities are one way for these institutions to offer new types of knowledge to local students and educators in the form of foreign expert-led workshops and cultural exchange projects.

2. Sociocultural rationalization

Both government officials and professionals in Taiwan’s dance field speak of the sociocultural benefits of connecting with the international community. By ‘sociocultural knowledge’, one refers to an ability to understand the behavioral norms and customs of other cultures and be able to act appropriately when one is outside of one’s own culture. In the first set of quotes below, Donald Lee, who holds the title of Ambassador for Diplomacy and International Affairs, is rationalizing the International Youth Ambassadors program while accompanying one of the teams on a visit to the Philippines. The tour, which was made up of sixteen youth ambassadors specializing in either dance or music performance, was part of the Asia Pacific delegation that visited several countries in South East Asia and the Pacific islands in September of 2014. In the first quote, Lee legitimates the program by discussing the educational benefits that the performers get while on tour:

Example 6:

The youth is very important in promoting peace and in developing our nation further. At an early age, the government fully supports their **holistic education**, which includes exposure to cultures

13) Ibid.

14) Y. L. Chao(2000), *Dance, Culture and Nationalism: The Sociocultural Significance of Cloud Gate Dance Theatre in Taiwanese Society*, Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Laban Centre and City University, London, p.12.

and backgrounds. This enables them to learn important values such as respect, tradition, and even develop critical thinking that would in turn, help the growth of Taiwan.¹⁵⁾

The youth teams not only present local culture to their audiences, but also gain knowledge about the traditions of the people they are interacting with. The program therefore uses instrumental rationalization to legitimate its establishment, as the knowledge of other cultures is said to cultivate respect for differing traditions and empathy for how other people live. In turn, the “holistic education” of these young people along with efforts to promote mutual understanding and respect will benefit Taiwan’s growth more generally.

The following quote discusses the reasons why the International Youth Ambassadors program was formed.

Example 7:

We launched the **International Youth Exchange Program** six years ago hoping to promote cultural exchange while providing humanitarian aid to areas in need. We do so for our young generation to know more about different countries, and more importantly, to encourage peaceful interaction amid cultural differences... In visiting the local community, the students will better understand the real life situation in the Philippines. They can also use this experience in future cooperation with their Asian neighbors.¹⁶⁾

In this example, the IYP is viewed as the means to educating Taiwanese youth about the world around them. So just as the government values the visibility gained from IYP tours, it also articulates the sociocultural benefits of the young people who participate in the tours.

Exposure to the world and to new cultural environments is also valued by Taiwan's dance professionals. Many young dancers go on international tours not only to perform but to learn about new cultures and innovative forms of dance. The experience can be an inspiration to dance and a boost to a dancer’s confidence as well. In the following quote, Y. P. Chen explains why her university, the Taipei National University of the Arts, places emphasis on internationalization abroad activities:

Example 8:

We will take them (dance students) out to **participate in dance festivals**. They perform there and they can see what the other students are doing from other countries...so that’s a good part of it... They gain a lot of confidence from that experience, because they can see that... our students, we are proud of them, they are well-trained...they go out and they perform well and they can see that

15) Mañalac, S. (2014, October 7), *TECO youth ambassadors immerse in Philippines*, <www.manilatimes.net/teco-youth-ambassadors-immerse-philippines/132448/, 2014. 12. 3>.

16) Ibid.

they are good dancers and it builds their confidence.¹⁷⁾

The faculty at TUT's dance department speak about building an international atmosphere at their university, something primarily driven by internationalization. One way to accomplish such an atmosphere is recruiting foreign staff, as explained by Faculty member A:

Example 9:

It is important to **have foreign teaching staff** if we want to create an international environment on campus. Visiting scholars would be also be valuable, even those who come primarily for research. Right now the foreign teachers who come to our department are only here for one or two weeks to introduce new pedagogical ideas... **having foreign staff here for longer periods is important** for students to get in the habit of seeing and interacting with those from different cultures.¹⁸⁾

A similar rationale is put forward for the value of having foreign students on campus, as Faculty member B articulates in the following quotes:

Example 10:

We can see more international students at our university, and we would like to have more **international students** here (in the department)... They make the world outside of Taiwan more real... They enrich our environment.¹⁹⁾

Example 11:

Our students can benefit (from having foreign students on campus)... It is like **the exchange we did with X College**, makes our school environment more attractive, more interesting to our students when we have international students here.²⁰⁾

If Examples 9 through 11 are taken together, it would seem that an 'international environment' is one where the world outside of Taiwan becomes more real to the staff and students of TUT, and studying in such an environment is more interesting with the prospect of interacting with foreign students and faculty.

3. Diversification of dance knowledge, innovation, and employability

As noted in the last section, another way that the internationalization of dance is legitimated in

17) Y. P. Chen, personal communication, December 20, 2014.

18) Faculty member A, personal communication, March 2, 2014.

19) Faculty member B, personal communication, April 24, 2014.

20) Ibid.

Taiwan is the access this provides for new ideas and inspirations, and also the possibility this affords for new careers in the arts. Dance educator S. Y. Liu provides the example of children's dance pedagogy to highlight this rationale. She notes the lack of comprehensive pedagogical training programs for dance teachers in Taiwan's universities, and how many young dance educators lack confidence when they start their careers teaching children. To offer a solution, she completed an action research project that used 'collaborative learning' strategies to give structure to dance lessons, an idea borrowed from Western pedagogical practices, and the new concept proved very useful for devising lesson plans for her student dance teachers. She concludes from her work in Taiwan and other, similar projects she has conducted in Europe and Africa that pedagogical frameworks can be transferrable to new contexts.²¹⁾

Dance scholar J. A. Tai offers a similar positive assessment of the value of incorporating new ideas in dance pedagogy, this time in private dance studios. She emphasizes the need for greater creativity in children's dance education, something that is often lost as teachers drill dance movements in technique classes. Presently, young dancers are expected to specialize in a narrow band of dance skills, and the aesthetic dispositions they develop from their training ultimately are thought to make it harder for them to become innovative dancers and dance teachers later in their careers. She advocates the idea of cultivating 'child-centered communities of practice', a combination of ideas borrowed from Etienne Wenger's notion of 'communities of practice'²²⁾ and the sociology of education, in order to give young learners a space for creativity. Such communities include teachers, parents and children in order to cultivate a supportive environment that allows for new pedagogical practices and aesthetic dispositions to develop. With such pedagogical innovations, Tai asserts, dance in Taiwan can overcome the problem of 'cultural reproduction',²³⁾ and offer dance educators a new avenue for developing their students' creativity.²⁴⁾

In regards to Taiwan's dance companies today, innovation is a marker of distinction, and as noted earlier, choreography often embraces the incorporation of new technology and hybrid forms of dance to achieve new aesthetic creations. This new aesthetic valuation of innovation is a worldwide trend in choreography, and press releases for performances often discuss the artists' ambition to break with tradition and show originality. Dance scholar I. W. Chang explains the implications for Taiwanese dancers' embrace of international trends in the creation of their works:

21) S. Y. Liu(2008), Transferable theory: Researching movement concepts in different cultural contexts, In S. Shapiro (Ed.), *Dance in a World of Change: Reflections on Globalization and Cultural Difference* (Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics), p.202.

22) E. Wenger(1998), *Communities of Practice: Learning, Meaning and Identity*(New York: Cambridge University Press).

23) P. Bourdieu(1990), *The Logic of Practice*(Palo Alto, CA: Stanford University Press).

24) J. A. Tai(2012), A case study of the reforms of dance in higher education in Taiwan. *Research in Dance Education* 13(1), p.81

Example 12:

The new generation of Taiwanese choreographers has brought renewed and vibrant energy to their experiments for new media and art, and at the same time, **the circulation of their work around the world** also helps make Taiwan internationally visible and politically valid. They are mixing imported ideas with the home-grown understanding to develop a new dance genus for contemporary Taiwan. **Their creativity in dance and technology might serve as a way to pursue a new definition of Taiwanese-ness in dialogue with a global environment.**²⁵⁾

According to Chang, the internationalization of dance in Taiwan is legitimated by the inspiration and innovative spirit it brings to the art. Local choreographers use technological and thematic ideas from elsewhere in combination with their own life experiences to guide their creative visions, and the innovative dance pieces they present then offer up new visions of what Taiwan means for both local and international audiences. Along with technology, the fusion of local dance with imported dance forms like hip hop has also stimulated new ideas for choreography, although many of these dances forms have yet to find their way into the curricula of university dance departments.

This embrace of technology and new kinds of dance performance is also said to enhance the career prospects of local dance professionals, and so the employability discourse has become an important legitimization strategy in Taiwan's dance in higher education. In seeking out new avenues for employment, local artists have sought out ideas from abroad for inspiration, and one endeavor borrowed from abroad has been for dancers to collaborate with commercial and industrial actors outside of the arts. This fusion of arts and industry, termed the 'cultural and creative industries' (CCI), was first proposed and developed in the United Kingdom in the late 1990s,²⁶⁾ and the idea has since been adopted as a strategy for improving economic vitality by many governments around the world. Yet the idea of dance as a cultural enterprise is also controversial.²⁷⁾ Some artists view the creations of such collaboration as shallow and not worthy of fine arts status, and hence refuse to participate.²⁸⁾

Dance professor Y. Y. Wang offers an example of the contingent status of dance as an enterprise when discussing one such CCI project.²⁹⁾ Her university, the Taipei National University of the Arts, was approached by the organizer of the World Games that were staged in Kaohsiung, southern Taiwan, in 2009, to produce the opening ceremony festivities. According to Wang, some of the colleges at the university decided not to participate as they considered the event a commercial

25) I. W. Chang(2013), *Dance and Technology: A New Aesthetical Trend in Taiwan*, <www.culturebot.org/2013/01/15572/the-new-aesthetics-of-dance-technology-in-taiwan/>, 2014.12 3>.

26) J. A. Tai(2010b), *Pride, Prejudice and Politics in Dance: The Rise of Dance as a Symbolic Power in Taiwan* (Germany: LAP Lambert Academic Publishing).

27) S. Shapiro(Ed.)(2008), *Dance in a World of Change: Reflections on Globalization and Cultural Difference* (Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics).

28) J. A. Tai(2010b).

29) Y.Y. Wang, personal communication, December 20, 2014.

spectacle unworthy of serious artists. The college of dance did decide to get involved, however, and, assisted by the college of music, produced a forty-five minute program in a stadium of 40,000 spectators. Wang herself was willing to choreograph the dance for the program, and felt that the result was much better than the shallow artistic effort many had feared it would be. In the end, Wang could justify participating as the colleges of music and dance each received positive international exposure and there was also significant financial compensation for the university as well. Furthermore, the dancers, all of them students at the university, were able to work in a new kind of environment and were also paid for their work.

As it is in other parts of the world, funding is often an obstacle for dance companies and university dance students who wish to perform abroad, and so more artists are now seeking collaboration with commercial firms. Because of this, it has become more common for both private dance companies and university dance departments to send dancers to public events such as ceremonies for facility openings, temple festivals, and televised celebrations, although the actual compensation does not always amount to much.³⁰⁾

4. Discourses of resistance

While dancers often look abroad for inspiration and ways to innovate, there are also external pressures that internationalization brings to the dance field. One such area of concern in Taiwan has been the importation of ‘best practices’ in quality control in education, and this concern is also expressed by dance educators and scholars in Taiwan's higher education system. Evaluation agencies like the Higher Education Evaluation and Accreditation Council of Taiwan (HEEACT) for comprehensive universities and the Taiwan Accreditation and Evaluation Agency (TWAEA) for technical and vocational universities put an emphasis on certain areas of internationalization depending on the type of university being evaluated. They may look at how many foreign faculty members are employed in the department, how many foreign students have enrolled, or how many articles have been published in SSCI or A&HCI journals by department faculty. As a way to improve evaluation scores, some Taiwanese universities are also putting pressure on departments to offer more courses in English to attract more foreign students. It is not possible to generalize which internationalization practices a dance department emphasizes, however, as they are not all evaluated by the same organization and will have certain areas of specialization. It is true however that such external pressure to internationalize and to conform to world class status is a problem noted by scholars in Taiwan,³¹⁾ although none of the dance departments have as yet been forced into adopting

30) J. A. Tai(2010a).

31) Chou, P. and Ching, G. (2012), *Taiwan Education at the Crossroad: When Globalization Meets Localization* (Basingstoke, U.K.: Palgrave Macmillan).

these potentially problematic internationalization practices by their respective universities. Dance departments thus far have been able to internationalize at their own pace.

The Department of Dance at Taipei National University of the Arts has one of the most advanced internationalization programs of any dance department in Taiwan to date. Foreign dance scholars and educators are frequently invited to teach courses and give seminars at the university, and the department also enrolls the most foreign students of any tertiary dance program in Taiwan. In the following quote, Y. P. Chen explains the department's approach to offering courses in English:

Example 13:

Yes, there are a few courses taught in English here, but that is part of the international program that is exclusive for foreigners... It is totally new, so there are only a few students now... the local students can take those courses but the constitution of the program is made up of foreign students... I am not sure if the course is a burden for staff... it would depend on how many students are in the class... If the majority is local students then it doesn't make sense to have it (in a foreign language)... In that case, teaching in English slows down the teaching process, and you cannot teach anything but the easier concepts...³²⁾

It appears then that the use of English in dance classes at TNUA is straightforward as the majority of the students in these special classes are foreigners. There is little worry therefore of local students not understanding an English language lecture since they do not typically enroll for such courses. Even so, it is still up to the department to find faculty members who are willing to lecture in English, and this is not always welcomed by staff. Y. Y. Wang mentions that local staff members receive higher hourly pay for lecturing in these special English language courses, but knows of one colleague who has taught such courses in the past and is hesitant to do it in the future for the extra pressure this brings.³³⁾ It is possible that this issue will grow in significance as the program recruits more students into its international program, but for now they are able to find enough local staff to teach these special lecture courses. In regards to inviting or employing foreign faculty members, many of these dance specialists offer special technique classes and seminars, and so local students are able to understand course content through the demonstration of dance movements. For this reason, most of the foreign staff in the department teach dance technique courses and not lecture courses. Regarding the need to publish articles in English, attend international conferences, or forge partnerships with foreign institutions, none of the staff at TNUA mentioned having any significant problems with these activities thus far.

32) Y. P. Chen, personal communication, December 20, 2014.

33) Y. Y. Wang, personal communication, December 20, 2014.

IV. Concluding Comments

As Section III of this article attests, much of the internationalization of the dance field in Taiwan has been welcomed by local practitioners as an appropriate response to living in a globalized 21st century world. Although globalization is said to present challenges to local systems of knowledge, in some cases imposing a standardized view of best practices and aesthetic tastes,³⁴⁾ Tai argues that there is much that the local can embrace from the ‘Other’ without compromising what is unique about the local perspective.³⁵⁾ Y.P. Chen concurs with this view, arguing that internationalization practices in local dance institutions are a kind of dialogue with global trends. Furthermore, as the dance field was formed during colonial times, dance forms have largely been imported from abroad over the past century. Hence, she believes that what is authentic about local dance is not its dance forms, which were originally borrowed from the West and Mainland China, but how dancers and choreographers in Taiwan have adapted what was borrowed, reinterpreting dance forms into new languages and original dance creations:

You put the globalization and internationalization as different terms, and to us, this is interesting, because, what is the difference? To me globalization means more, about, there is a certain force that is coming from the outside that is an influence, and of course we add to that. But internationalization... we are reaching out, from where we are. So it is different, how we see ourselves in these two terms... The dance field was formed during colonial times, so we have been accustomed to taking ideas from other places, so for us, internationalization has always been a part of dance in Taiwan... For us, to be international is to be natural.³⁶⁾

In summary, the dance field in Taiwan, represented by a variety of voices and institutions, legitimates its internationalization practices through a variety of discursive strategies. Local dance practitioners speak of gaining visibility for their institutions and Taiwan, learning about foreign cultures, gaining confidence and inspiration for new pedagogical and performance directions, and finding new employment opportunities in order to rationalize the growing number of connections and collaborations with the international dance community. Although there is potential for conflict in the form of best practices from abroad being imposed on the local higher education dance scene, the voices of higher education dance professionals have so far discounted the threat. This is because internationalization, as shown in this article, is legitimated through rationalization and not

34) M. E. Savigliano(2009), *Worlding dance and dancing out there in the world*, In S. Foster (Ed.), *Worlding Dance*(Basingstoke, UK: Palgrave Macmillan), p.164.

35) J. A. Tai(2010c), The effects of globalization on the field of dance and dance education in Taiwan, *Research in Arts Education* 19, p.183.

36) Y. P. Chen, personal communication, December 20, 2014.

authorization (i.e. following rules and targets set by universities, the government, and external organizations). Through the decentralization of Taiwan's higher education, dance departments and professionals have had the freedom to implement their own international programs at the pace they desire, and so the internationalization of dance has largely been bottom-up driven in Taiwan's higher education.

■ Bibliography

- Bourdieu, P. (1990). *The Logic of Practice*. Palo Alto, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Chou, P. and Ching, G. (2012). *Taiwan Education at the Crossroad: When Globalization Meets Localization*. Basingstoke, U.K.: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Egron-Polak, E. (2012). Internationalization of higher education: A few global trends and regional perspectives. In C. Ennew and D. Greenaway (Eds.), *The Globalization of Higher Education* (pp. 57-69). Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Fairclough, N. (2003). *Analysing Discourse: Textual Analysis for Social Research*. London: Routledge.
- Knight, J. (2006). *Internationalization of Higher Education: New Directions, New Challenges*. 2005 IAU Global Survey Report, International Association of Universities (IAU).
- Prevots, N. (1998). *Dance for Export: Cultural Diplomacy and the Cold War*. Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press.
- Robertson, R. (1992). *Globalization: Social Theory and Global Culture*. London: Sage.
- Savigliano, M. E. (2009). Worlding dance and dancing out there in the world. In S. Foster (Ed.), *Worlding Dance* (pp. 163-187). Basingstoke, UK: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Shapiro, S. (Ed.) (2008). *Dance in a World of Change: Reflections on Globalization and Cultural Difference*. Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics.
- Tai, J. A. (2010b). *Pride, Prejudice and Politics in Dance: The Rise of Dance as a Symbolic Power in Taiwan*. Germany: LAP Lambert Academic Publishing.
- Wenger, E. (1998). *Communities of Practice: Learning, Meaning and Identity*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Chao, Y. L. (2000). *Dance, Culture and Nationalism: The Sociocultural Significance of Cloud Gate Dance Theatre in Taiwanese Society*. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, Laban Centre and City University, London.
- Tai, J. A. (2010a). *Dance as an Institutional Power: A Bourdieuan Approach to Socio-political Changes in Dance in Higher Education in Taiwan*. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, University of Surrey, UK.
- Tai, J. A. (2010c). The effects of globalization on the field of dance and dance education in Taiwan. *Research in Arts Education*, 19: 183-204.
- Tai, J. A. (2012). A case study of the reforms of dance in higher education in Taiwan. *Research in Dance Education*, 13(1): 67-82.
- van Leeuwen, T. (2007). Legitimation in discourse and communication. *Discourse and Communication*, 1: 91-112.
- Chang, I. W. (2013). *Dance and Technology: A New Aesthetical Trend in Taiwan*. <www.culturebot.org/>

- 2013/01/15572/the-new-aesthetics-of-dance-technology-in-taiwan/, 2014. 12. 3.>.
- Mañalac, S. (2014, October 7). *TECO youth ambassadors immerse in Philippines*. <www.manilatimes.net/teco-youth-ambassadors-immerse-philippines/132448/>, 2014. 12. 3.>.
- Ministry of Education, Taiwan (2014). *2014 English Program List*. <http://web.roc-taiwan.org/public/CH_en_education/412017195571.pdf>, 2016. 7. 29.>.
- Ministry of Foreign Affairs (2014). *2014 International Youth Ambassador Exchange Program registration underway*. <www.mofa.gov.tw/ENMobile?News_Content.aspx?s=3FE415105977ACFF>, 2014. 12. 3.>.

논문투고일 2016. 8. 1.
심사일 2016. 8. 22.
심사완료일 2016. 8. 30.

대만 고등교육 무용의 국제화

합법화 전략

토마스 하이워드* · 주안앤 타이**

일본 나고야 대학교 커뮤니케이션 조교수* · 대만 타이난 대학교 무용과 교수**

지난 20년 동안, 대만 고등교육의 국제화는 정부 혹은 인구학적 압박이건, 떠오르는 산재된 자원들의 성장이건 간에 다양한 이유를 가지고 가속화 되었다. 본 연구는 대만 고등교육의 무용에 관하여 집중적으로 기술하였다. van Leeuwen의 합법화 이론을 방법론적 기틀로 사용하여, 본 논문은 국제화의 가치의 명료성을 대만 무용 고등교육계의 주요 인물들의 음성과 문자 텍스트를 가지고 조사하였다. 정부담화와 공식 연설문, 그리고 학계 주요학자들의 인터뷰 검토를 통해, 본 연구는 국제화의 저항하는 담론이 존재하는 반면, 문화 창조적 산업과 관련한 질적 확신과 부조화된 감정들 가운데 ‘최상의 해결책’의 중요성이라는 이름하에 대만 고등 교육 안에 무용의 가치 가정들이 매우 긍정적임을 발견하였다. 본 연구의 결과들은 고등교육계의 대만 무용의 국제화의 지속된 성장을 시사하고 있다.

키워드: 고등교육의 국제화(Internationalization of higher education), 합법화(Legitimation), 담론(Discourse), 명료성(Articulation), 가치 가정(Value assumption)